ONTARIO Superior Court of Justice

Defence Form 9A Ont. Reg. No.: 258/98

	TORONTO	SC-00012345-0000		
	Small Claims Court	Claim No.		
	47 SHEPPARD AVENUE E., 3 ^R	^D FLOOR		
	TORONTO, ON M2N 5N1			
	Address			
	(416) 326-3554			
	Phone number			
Plaintiff No. 1	Additional plaintiff(s) listed on attac	ched Form 1A. Under 18 years of age.		
Last name, or name of company				
SMITH				
First name	Second name	Also known as		
JOHN				
Address (street number, apt., unit)				
123 MAIN STREET				
City/Town	Province	Phone no.		
TORONTO	ON	(416) 555 5555		
Postal code		Email address		
M1A 1A1		JOHNANDMARY@SMITHS.CA		
Representative		Law Society of Ontario no.		
JUSTIN CASE		P01234		
Address (street number, apt., unit)				
100 BAY STREET, SUITE 100				
City/Town	Province	Phone no.		
TORONTO	ON	(416) 555-1000		
Postal code		Email address		
M9Z 9Z9		JUSTIN@CASE.LAW		
Defendant No. 1	Additional defendant(s) listed on a			
Last name, or name of company				
ROOFING EXPERTS INC.				
First name	Second name	Also known as		
Address (street number, apt., unit)				
987 TROUBLE LANE				
City/Town	Province	Phone no.		
TORONTO	ON	(416) 555-6666		
Postal code		Email address		
M1Z 1Z1		NEWROOF@NEWROOF.CA		
Representative		Law Society of Ontario no.		
GITAR DUNN		P09876		
Address (street number, apt., unit)				
111 BAY STREET, SUITE 111				
City/Town	Province	Phone no.		
TORONTO	ON	(416) 555-9999		
Postal code		Email address		
M2Y Y2Y		GITAR@DUNN.LEGAL		

Les formules des tribunaux sont affichées en anglais et en français sur le site <u>www.ontariocourtforms.on.ca</u>. Visitez ce site pour des renseignements sur des formats accessibles.

ONTARIO
Superior Court of Justice

PAGE 1A

Additional Parties

Form 1A Ont. Reg. No.: 258/98

SC-00012345-0000

Claim No.

Plaintiff No. TWO (2)		Defendant I	No.
Last name, or name of company SMITH			
First name	Second name		Also known as
MARY			
Address (street number, apt., unit) 123 MAIN STREET			
City/Town	Province		Phone no.
TORONTO	ON		(416) 555-5555
Postal code			Email address
M1A 1A1			JOHNANDMARY@SMITHS.CA
Representative JUSTIN CASE			Law Society of Ontario no. P012345
Address (street number, apt., unit)			1012040
100 BAY STREET, SUITE 100			
City/Town	Province		Phone no.
TORONTO	ON		(416) 555-1000
Postal code M9Z 9Z9			Email address JUSTIN@CASE.LAW
Plaintiff No.		Defendant l	No. TWO (2)
Last name, or name of company			
JONES			
First name BRUCE	Second name		Also known as
Address (street number, apt., unit) 987 TROUBLE LANE			
City/Town	Province		Phone no.
TORONTO Postal code	ON		(416) 555-6666
M1Z 1Z1			Email address BRUCE@NEWROOF.CA
Representative			Law Society of Ontario no.
GITAR DUNN			P09876
Address (street number, apt., unit) 111 BAY STREET, SUITE 111			
City/Town	Province		Phone no.
TORONTO Postal code	ON		(416) 555-9999 Email address
M2Y Y2Y			GITAR@DUNN.LEGAL
Plaintiff No.		Defendant I	No.
Last name, or name of company			
First name	Second name		Also known as
Address (street number, apt., unit)			
City/Town	Province		Phone no.
Postal code			Email address
Representative			Law Society of Ontario no
Address (street number, apt., unit)			
City/Town	Province		Phone no.
Postal code			Email address

Claim No.

THIS DEFENCE IS BEING FILED ON BEHALF OF: (Name(s) of defendant(s))

-		-				
ROO	FING EXPERTS INC.	and BRUCE JONES	6			
and I	/we: (Check as many as a	pply)				
\square	Dispute the claim made	de against me/us.				
	Admit the full claim and propose the following terms of payment:					
	\$	per	commencing	, 20		
	(Amount)	(Week/I	month)			
	Admit part of the claim in the amount of \$(An		and propose the follow (Amount)	and propose the following terms of payment:		
	\$(Amount)	_ per(Week/i	commencing	, 20		

REASONS FOR DISPUTING THE CLAIM AND DETAILS:

Explain what happened, including where and when. Explain why you do not agree with the claim made against you.

If you are relying on any documents, you **MUST** attach copies to the Defence. If evidence is lost or unavailable, you **MUST** explain why it is not attached.

What happened? AS PER ATTACHED SCHEDULE 'A' Where? When?

Why I/we disagree AS PER ATTACHED SCHEDULE 'A' with all or part of the claim:

\boxtimes Additional pages are attached because more room was needed.

Prepared on: NOVEMBER 15 , 20 20

(Signature of defendant or representative)

NOTE:	Within seven (7) calendar days of changing your address for service, notify the court and all other parties in writing.

CAUTION TO PLAINTIFF(S): If this Defence contains a proposal of terms of payment, you are deemed to have acce terms unless you file with the clerk and serve on the defendant(s) a Request to Clerk for a terms of payment hearing WITHIN TWENTY (20) CALENDAR DAYS of service of Defence [R. 9.03(3)].	(Form 9B)
---	-----------

SCHEDULE 'A'

Denials

1. Except as may otherwise be expressly hereinafter admitted, the Defendants, Roofing Experts Inc. ("Roofing Experts") and Bruce Jones ("Bruce"), deny each and every allegation and put the Plaintiffs to strict proof thereof and the Defendants further deny that the Plaintiffs are entitled to the relief as claimed within the Plaintiff's Claim; or alternatively, that the Plaintiffs are entitled to the relief as claimed from the Defendants.

Admissions

2. The Defendants admit or accept the allegations or statements contained within paragraphs 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 16, 21, 23, 24, 43, 44, and 45, of the Plaintiff's Claim.

Incomplete Knowledge

3. The Defendants are without knowledge or without complete knowledge or without direct knowledge with respect to the allegations or statements contained in paragraph 15, 17, 18, 19, 20, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, and 32, of the Plaintiff's Claim.

Additional Statements (including legal defences)

Faulty Workmanship Denial

4. The Defendants state that any and all workmanship performed by the Defendants was proper and usual to the standards of the roofing trade.

Damage as Caused by Plaintiff

5. The residential dwelling ("House") located upon the subject Premises, is a two storey with a one-and-a-half storey attached garage ("Garage").

6. The attached garage is attached to the west side of the House.

7. The Defendant, Roofing Experts, was hired to perform work only upon the House.

8. Roofing Experts provided an offer to install asphalt shingles upon the Garage.

9. The Plaintiffs declined the offer to install asphalt shingles upon the Garage.

10. The Plaintiff's Claim allegations of interior water damage to ceilings and walls of the House, if any, was caused by water ingress along roof beams and joists from the Garage.

11. Accordingly, the Plaintiffs failure to choose roofing services for the Garage portion of the House caused, or contributed, to the loss, if any, as suffered by the Plaintiffs.

Alternate Causation

12. Furthermore, and alternatively, any and all damage to the House was caused by water ingress through flaws within the soffit and fascia.

13. Persons unknown installed the soffit and fascia prior to the work of the Defendants.

14. Prior to entering to the contract with the Plaintiffs, the Plaintiffs were advised that the soffit and fascia needed prompt replacement.

15. The Plaintiffs were provided such advisement by Bruce.

16. Roofing Experts provided a quote to replace the soffit and fascia to the Plaintiffs.

17. The Plaintiffs declined the quote to replace of the soffit and fascia.

Force Majeure

18. Furthermore, and alternatively, the Plaintiff's Claim allegations of a thunderstorm with high winds was a tornado event.

19. The tornado was rated EF4 on the Enhanced Fujita Scale by Environment Canada.

20. The tornado funnel passed within 200 yards of the House.

21. Any and all damage to the House was caused by the tornado event, as a *force majeure*, rather than by defective workmanship.

Failure to Mitigate

22. Furthermore, and alternatively, the Plaintiffs paid for excessively priced restoration services as provided by Complete Restoration Services Inc. ("Complete").

23. The Plaintiffs failed to exercise due diligence when seeking restoration services and thereby failed to obtain more conservatively priced and available restoration services.

Pleadings & Reliances

24. This Defendants plead and rely upon;

(a) The Courts of Justice Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. C.43; as amended;

- (b) The Negligence Act, 2002, R.S.O. 1990, c. N.1; as amended;
- (c) The Rules of the Small Claims Court, O. Reg. 258/98; as amended;
- (d) The common law and further statutes and regulations as shall be disclosed prior to trial.

Jurisdiction

25. This Defendants agree and accept that the Toronto Small Claims Court is the proper *forum conveniens* with the jurisdiction to hear this matter.

Dismissal

26. For the aforesaid reasons, the Defendants respectfully plead and state that the Plaintiff's Claim lacks a reasonable cause of action and that the Plaintiff's Claim should be dismissed with full indemnity costs in favour of the Defendants as in accordance with the *Rules of the Small Claims Court* as well as the doctrine in *Propane Levac Propane Inc. v. Macauley*, 2011 ONSC 293 for the improper bringing of unreasonable claims as are unsupportable in fact, law, and equity.